

Legislative Assembly Province of Alberta

No. 29

# **VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

Fourth Session

Twenty-Fourth Legislature

Monday, April 17, 2000

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

# **Presenting Petitions**

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, presented a petition from 982 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, presented a petition from 638 Calgary residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, presented a petition from 571 Albertans stating that the Progressive Conservative Party will not be supported if Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act and Bill 18, Alberta Personal Income Tax Act, are passed.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 364 Albertans regarding requesting the introduction of a bill banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals in Alberta to maintain the integrity of the public, universal health care system.

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, presented a petition from 951 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, presented a petition from 898 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, presented a petition from 40 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Strang, Hon. Member for West Yellowhead, presented a petition from 1,859 Grande Cache and area residents urging the Government to improve Highway 40 south of Grande Cache in response to a fatality on that highway on February 7, 2000.

#### **Reading and Receiving Petitions**

On request by Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of the Province of Alberta, hereby petition the Legislative Assembly to pass a bill banning private for-profit hospitals in Alberta so that the integrity of the public, universal health care system may be maintained.

# **Notices of Motions**

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, gave oral notice of her intention to move the following motion under Standing Order 40:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly adjourn the ordinary business of the Assembly to consider the following motion:

Be it resolved that this Assembly has no confidence in the Government.

# **Tabling Returns and Reports**

Hon. Ms Evans, Minister of Children's Services:

Report of the Task Force on Children at Risk entitled "Start Young Start Now!" Sessional Paper 631/2000

Hon. Mr. Dunford, Minister of Human Resources and Employment, pursuant to the Engineering, Geological and Geophysical Professions Act, cE-11.1, s12(4):

Association of Professional Engineers, Geologists and Geophysicists of Alberta (APEGGA), Annual Report 1999-2000

Sessional Paper 632/2000

Hon. Mr. Dunford, Minister of Human Resources and Employment, pursuant to the Architects Act, cA-44.1, s6(4):

Alberta Association of Architects, Annual Report 1999

Sessional Paper 633/2000

Hon. Mr. Dunford, Minister of Human Resources and Employment:

Report dated March 31, 2000, entitled "Two-Year Review of the Personal Directives Act" prepared by the Interdepartmental Coordinating Committee on Personal Directives, Government of Alberta

Sessional Paper 634/2000

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford:

E-mail message, undated, from Professor Richard Plain, Health Economist, Medicare Economics Group, University of Alberta, to Members of the Legislative Assembly (MLAs), with attached proposed amendments to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 635/2000

4 e-mail messages from Pilar Gateman to all Members of the Legislative Assembly, Jack Clack and Evelyn Soltys, both of Lethbridge, to all Members of the Legislative Assembly, and Gabor Takats, Edmonton, to Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, expressing concern with, and opposition to, Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 636/2000

E-mail message dated April 14, 2000, from Brian Jackson, Calgary, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, urging the Premier to allow a free vote on Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 637/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

Letter dated March 21, 2000, from Peter Nettleton, Calgary, to Hon. Mr. Mar, Minister of Environment, expressing opposition to the development of the Spray Lakes area in Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 638/2000

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert:

Letter dated April 10, 2000, from Justin Brooks, Grade 6 student, Brookwood Elementary School, Spruce Grove, to Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 639/2000

Letter dated April 14, 2000, from Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, to Mr. Langevin, Hon. Member for Lac La Biche-St. Paul, issuing a second invitation to debate the merits of Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, at a mutually agreeable time at a location of his choice

Sessional Paper 640/2000

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar:

News release dated April 15, 2000, entitled "MacBeth Calls on Albertans to Urge Their MLAs to Respect the Wishes of Constituents and Vote Against Bill 11" prepared by the Alberta Liberal Caucus

Sessional Paper 641/2000

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview:

Report, undated, entitled "Progress Report at a Glance" providing a portrait of children and youth in Canada and Backgrounder, dated January 25, 2000, entitled "Why do we need a National Children's Agenda?" setting out trends documented in "The Progress of Canada's Children 1999/2000" both prepared by the Canadian Council on Social Development

Sessional Paper 642/2000

Report dated December 1999, entitled "Does Mother or Father Know Best? An Assessment of Parent/Child Agreement in the Canadian Longitudinal Survey of Children and Youth" prepared by Lori Curtis and Shelley Phipps, both of Dalhousie University, and Martin Dooley, McMaster University

Sessional Paper 643/2000

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora:

Updates of Government of Alberta website documents, undated, entitled "Bill 11 Debate Summary for Monday, April 10, 2000" and "Bill 11 Debate Summary for Tuesday, April 11, 2000"

Sessional Paper 644/2000

Statement, dated March 30, 2000, entitled "Is Bill 11 Good for Albertans?" prepared by the Interfaith Coalition on Justice in the Workplace, Edmonton, setting out questions, answers and recommendations regarding Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 645/2000

Information sheet, undated, urging Albertans to contact their MLAs (Members of the Legislative Assembly) to express opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 646/2000

# Recognitions

Ms Kryczka, Hon. Member for Calgary-West: 4th annual Volunteer Calgary leadership awards, held at the Palliser Hotel, Calgary, April 13, 2000, celebrating the contributions of youth, business, and individuals, to Alberta communities

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre: 84th anniversary of the enfranchisement of women in Alberta, April 1916, the first provincial election in Canada in which women could exercise that franchise in June 1917 resulting in the election of Louise McKinney, and the fact that aboriginals were not enfranchised until the 1960s

Mr. Coutts, Hon. Member for Livingstone-Macleod: Mr. Speaker's Youth Parliament, involving 80 grade 10 students held at the Legislature April 13-14, 2000, the Royal Canadian Legion Alberta-Northwest Territories Command, Hon. Mr. Kowalski, Speaker of the Legislative Assembly, and staff of the Assembly, for organizing and facilitating the event

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview: 90th anniversary of the Girl Guides of Canada, the 21,000 Alberta guiding members, and Girl Guides Sandwich Cookie Weeks, April 1-May 14, 2000

Ms Fritz, Hon. Member for Calgary-Cross: Baisakhi 2000, a celebration of Khalsa, by members of the Calgary Sikh community, Saturday, April 15, 2000

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie: Brian Staszenski, on being recognized by Time Magazine as a hero for the planet, for his founding of the destination conservation program in 1987 which helps schools save energy, conserve water, and minimize waste production

Mrs. O'Neill, Hon. Member for St. Albert: the death of Tom Whiting on April 9, 2000, in St. Albert, and his contributions as a businessman in fighting the National Energy Program for the jobs of his employees and all oil patch workers in Alberta

# **Motions Under Standing Order 40**

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, requested the unanimous consent of the Assembly for consideration of the following motion:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly adjourn the ordinary business of the Assembly to consider the following motion:

Be it resolved that this Assembly has no confidence in the Government.

Unanimous consent to proceed was not granted.

# **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

# **Government Bills and Orders**

#### **Committee of the Whole**

According to Order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of the Whole, and the Acting Speaker left the Chair.

(Assembly in Committee)

# Adjournment

Pursuant to Standing Order 4(3), at 5:30 p.m., the Committee recessed until 8:00 p.m.

MONDAY, APRIL 17, 2000 — 8:00 P.M.

# **Government Bills and Orders**

#### **Committee of the Whole**

(Assembly in Committee)

The following Bill was taken under consideration:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act — Hon. Mr. Jonson

After some time spent therein, Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, moved that the Committee rise and report progress. The question being put, with Mr. Tannas in the Chair, the motion was agreed to. The names being called for were taken as follows:



For the motion: 30

Boutilier	Hierath	Oberg
Cao	Jacques	Pham
Clegg	Jonson	Renner
Doerksen	Langevin	Severtson
Forsyth	Lougheed	Stelmach
Friedel	Lund	Tarchuk
Fritz	Mar	Trynchy
Graham	Marz	West
Hancock	McClellan	Woloshyn
Herard	O'Neill	Zwozdesky

Against the motion: 14

Blakeman	Leibovici	Pannu
Bonner	MacBeth	Sapers
Carlson	MacDonald	Sloan
Dickson	Massey	White
Gibbons	Olsen	

The Deputy Speaker assumed the Chair.

Progress was reported on the following Bill:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act — Hon. Mr. Jonson

Mr. Herard, Acting Chairman of Committees, tabled copies of all amendments considered by the Committee of the Whole on this date for the official records of the Assembly.

Amendment to Bill 11 (Section A) (Introduced by the Minister of Health on and Wellness on April 12, 2000) — Subamendment introduced Sessional Paper 647/2000

Subamendment to the amendment to Bill 11 introduced by the Minister of Health on and Wellness on April 12, 2000 (Section A) (Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark) — Debate adjourned

Sessional Paper 648/2000

# **Government Bills and Orders**

#### Second Reading

The following Bills were read a Second time and referred to Committee of the Whole:

- Bill 3 Statute Revision Act Hon. Mr. Hancock
- Bill 7 Alberta Science, Research and Technology Authority Amendment Act, 2000
  (\$) Hon. Dr. Taylor
  - 7

# Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 11:58 p.m. until Tuesday, April 18, 2000, at 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Ken Kowalski, Speaker

Title: Monday, April 17, 2000